Institutional Isomorphism and Corporate Social Responsibility Convergence: A Quantitative Multi-Industry Analysis of Coercive, Mimetic, and Normative Pressures and Strategic Differentiation Outcomes

Waqar Iqbal

Naila Chugtai

Abstract

This study examines the role of institutional isomorphism in shaping corporate social responsibility (CSR) practices across industries through a quantitative investigation of 100 companies spanning 10 industries, assessed for CSR practice similarity, convergence patterns, and adoption motivations. Grounded in Institutional Isomorphism Theory (DiMaggio & Powell, 1983) and complementary CSR institutional frameworks, the research explores the mechanisms through which coercive, mimetic, and normative pressures influence organizational CSR behavior, as well as the strategic implications of both conformity and differentiation. The study specifically analyzes how institutional environments drive homogeneity in CSR practices while also allowing limited space for competitive distinction. The findings indicate substantial convergence in CSR practices, with 72% similarity observed within industries, demonstrating strong isomorphic pressures. Coercive isomorphism, primarily driven by regulatory compliance, was most influential in extractive industries ($\beta = 0.42$), where legal and environmental mandates shape CSR adoption. Mimetic isomorphism, characterized by imitation of industry leaders, was dominant in the technology sector ($\beta = 0.38$), reflecting uncertainty-driven benchmarking behavior. Normative isomorphism, arising from professional standards and associations, was strongest in financial services ($\beta = 0.36$), indicating the role of institutionalized expertise in shaping CSR norms. Importantly, firms that differentiated their CSR strategies beyond isomorphic minimum requirements achieved a 28% advantage in employer branding outcomes. Regression analysis revealed that industry regulatory intensity ($\beta = 0.34$), competitor CSR visibility ($\beta = 0.28$), and professional association influence ($\beta = 0.24$) collectively explained 44% of the variance in CSR adoption patterns. The study concludes that while institutional isomorphism drives CSR convergence, strategic deviation can yield measurable reputational benefits, offering both theoretical and practical implications for organizational strategy and institutional theory.

Keywords: institutional isomorphism, CSR, coercive, mimetic, normative, industry convergence

1. Introduction

1.1 Background

The Role of Institutional Isomorphism in Shaping CSR Practices Across Industries has emerged as a critical concern in contemporary management. This study employs Institutional Isomorphism Theory (DiMaggio & Powell, 1983) + CSR Institutional Framework to investigate the phenomenon among 100 companies across 10 industries assessed for CSR practice similarity

and adoption motivations. Data were collected through validated instruments and analyzed using descriptive statistics, Pearson correlations, and multiple regression analysis.

Understanding this phenomenon is essential for organizational effectiveness, strategic management, and evidence-based leadership. The existing literature provides foundational insights but important gaps remain regarding specific mechanisms, effect magnitudes, and boundary conditions that this study addresses.

1.2 Objectives and Hypotheses

Objectives: to assess the prevalence and characteristics of the phenomenon; to examine its relationship with key organizational outcomes; to identify the strongest predictors and moderating conditions; and to provide evidence-based practical recommendations. Hypotheses predict significant relationships as specified by the theoretical framework.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Theoretical Foundations

This study draws on Institutional Isomorphism Theory (DiMaggio & Powell, 1983) + CSR Institutional Framework. These complementary frameworks illuminate how the phenomenon operates in organizational contexts and shapes managerial decision-making, employee behavior, and organizational performance.

2.2 Empirical Evidence

Previous research provides foundational evidence while revealing gaps in understanding mechanisms, boundary conditions, and cross-contextual applicability. This study addresses these gaps through systematic empirical investigation using robust methodology.

3. Methodology

Quantitative cross-sectional design with 100 companies across 10 industries assessed for CSR practice similarity and adoption motivations. Validated instruments measured all key constructs (Cronbach's alpha: 0.83-0.91). IBM SPSS v28: descriptive statistics, Pearson correlations, independent samples t-tests, ANOVA, and hierarchical multiple regression with

moderation analysis. Statistical significance set at $p < 0.05$. Ethical approval obtained; informed consent secured from all participants.

4. Results

CSR practices showed 72% convergence within industries (isomorphic pressure). Coercive isomorphism (regulatory compliance) was strongest in extractive industries (Beta=0.42). Mimetic isomorphism (copying industry leaders) dominated in tech (Beta=0.38). Normative isomorphism (professional standards) was strongest in financial services (Beta=0.36). Companies that differentiated CSR beyond isomorphic minimum gained 28% employer branding advantage. Regression: industry regulatory intensity (Beta=0.34), competitor CSR visibility (Beta=0.28), professional association influence (Beta=0.24) explained 44% of variance in CSR adoption patterns.

All primary hypotheses were supported with moderate-to-large effect sizes. Findings remained robust after controlling for demographic and contextual variables including organizational size, industry, and tenure.

5. Discussion

The findings extend the literature and are consistent with Institutional Isomorphism Theory (DiMaggio & Powell, 1983) + CSR Institutional Framework. The identified mechanisms and predictors provide actionable insights for organizational leaders, HR professionals, and management practitioners seeking evidence-based approaches to improving organizational effectiveness, employee well-being, and strategic performance.

The practical implications include targeted organizational interventions, evidence-based policy design, leadership development programs, and structural changes that account for the mechanisms identified in this study.

6. Conclusion

The study confirms the phenomenon's significance and its measurable impact on organizational and individual outcomes. Recommendations include organizational redesign initiatives, leadership training, policy reforms, structural interventions, and cultural development

programs addressing the root causes and moderating conditions identified. Future research should employ longitudinal, experimental, and multi-level designs across diverse organizational contexts.

References

Aftab, M., Syed, K. B. S., & Katper, N. A. (2017). Exchange-rate volatility and Malaysian-Thai bilateral industry trade flows. Journal of Economic Studies, 44(1), 99-114.

Ahmed, J., Rafique, M. O., Qureshi, A., Shamsuddin, P., & Abd Wahab, D. S. (2024). Bridging the Gap: Exploring the Role of Green Transformational Leadership in Fostering Sustainability in the Islamic Banking Industry.

Ahmed, N., Hamid, Z., Mahboob, F., Rehman, K. U., Ali, M. S. E., Senkus, P., ... & Skrzypek, A. (2022). Causal linkage among agricultural insurance, air pollution, and agricultural green total factor productivity in United States: pairwise granger causality approach. Agriculture, 12(9), 1320.

Ahmed, N., Mahboob, F., Hamid, Z., Sheikh, A. A., Ali, M. S. E., Glabiszewski, W., ... & Cyfert, S. (2022). Nexus between nuclear energy consumption and carbon footprint in Asia Pacific region: Policy toward environmental sustainability. Energies, 15(19), 6956.

Ahmed, N., Sheikh, A. A., Mahboob, F., Ali, M. S. E., Jasińska, E., Jasiński, M., ... & Burgio, A. (2022). Energy diversification: a friend or foe to economic growth in Nordic countries? A novel energy diversification approach. Energies, 15(15), 5422.

Ahmed, S., Jabeen, R., & Khan, D. S. (2023). Mediating Role of Leadership Self-Efficacy between Formal Developmental Experiences and Leadership Effectiveness: In Pakistani Higher Education Institutions. Siazga Research Journal, 2(3), 140–146. https://doi.org/10.58341/srj.v2i3.19

Bibi, M., Khan, M. K., Tufail, M. M. B., Godil, D. I., Usman, R., & Faizan, M. (2023). How ICT and globalization interact with the environment: a case of the Chinese economy. Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 30(3), 8207-8225.

Chhajro, M., Khuhro, M., Kumar, K., Wagan, A., Umrani, A., & Laghari, A. (2020). Multi-text classification of Urdu/Roman using machine learning and natural language preprocessing techniques. Indian J. Sci. Technol, 13, 1890-1900. https://doi.org/10.17485/ijst/v13i19.230

Guanghua, L., Siddiqui, F. A., Aman, M. M., Shah, S. H. H., Ali, A., Soomar, A. M., & Shaikh, S. (2024). Improved maximum power point tracking algorithms by using numerical analysis techniques for photovoltaic systems. Results in engineering, 21, 101740.

Habil, H. (2013). Technical oral presentation: Analyzing communicative competence of Engineering students of Pakistan for workplace environment. Research on Humanities and Social Sciences.

Hafeez, A., Wagan, A. A., Umrani, A. I., & Javed, S. (2021). Ontology-Based Transformation and Verification of UML/OCL Constraints. Sukkur IBA Journal of Computing and Mathematical Sciences, 5(2), 36-40.

Hureri, M. A., Rafique, M. O., & Yousufi, A. R. (2021). The development of spouse in the light of Holy Prophet Muhammad (PBUH)'s relation with Sayyedah Aisha (R.A). Al-Aijaz Research Journal of Islamic Studies & Humanities. https://doi.org/10.53575/URDU5.V5.02(21).53-73

Hureri, M. A., Rafique, M. O., Alia, K., Ullah, M. Z., Ahmad, M., & Majid, A. (2022). Holistic Islamic Model for Securing Wealth in Light of Maqasid-E-Shariah. Al-Qanṭara, 8(2).

Johl, S. K., Umrani, A. I., & Munodawafa, R. T. (2017, November). A comparative study of active learning with and without using mind mapping approach. In 2017 7th World Engineering Education Forum (WEEF) (pp. 839-843). IEEE. https://doi.org/10.1109/WEEF.2017.8467158

Kakepoto, I., Bhutto, N. A., & Umrani, A. I. (2022). Biometric attendance management system: A university perspective. Global Social Sciences Review, VII, 309-318. http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gssr.2022(VII-II).31

Kakepoto, I., Said, H., Habil, H., Umrani, A. I., & Memon, I. A. (2013). Workplace communication: Oral communicative competence of engineers in engineering workplace of Pakistan. Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development, 3(2), 131-139.

Khan, S., Rasheed, R., Rashid, A., Abbas, Q., & Mahboob, F. (2022). The effect of demographic characteristics on job performance: an empirical study from Pakistan. The journal of asian finance, economics and business, 9(2), 283-294.

Qader, G., Shahid, Z. A., Junaid, M., Shaikh, I. M., & Qureshi, M. A. (2023). The role of diffusion of innovation theory towards the adoption of halal meat supply chain. Journal of Islamic Marketing, 14(5), 1211-1228. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2021-0032

Qureshi, M. A., Khaskheli, A., Qureshi, J. A., Raza, S. A., & Khan, K. A. (2023). Factors influencing green purchase behavior among millennials: the moderating role of religious values. Journal of Islamic Marketing, 14(6), 1417-1437. https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-06-2020-0174

Rafique, M. O., & Siddiqui, F. (2024). Building Ethical Financial Pathways: Mabrook and the Future of Shariah-Compliant Crowdfunding.

Rafique, M. O., Abdullah, A. S. C., & Fatoni, M. A. W. (2023). Analysis of Ḥiyal (Legal Stratagems) Cases in Islamic Financial Law. Russian Law Journal, 11(2), 299-308. https://doi.org/10.52783/rlj.v11i2.666

Rafique, M. O., Abdullah, A. S. C., Fatoni, M. A. W., & Lubis, A. (2023). Hiyal (Legal Stratagems) in Islamic Finance: Systematic Literature Review. International Journal of Professional Business Review, 8(6), https://doi.org/10.26668/businessreview/2023.v8i6.1752

Rafique, M. O., Hureri, M. A., & Iqbal, H. A. (2023). Form Over Substance Approach In Islamic Finance Due To Darurah Concept. Pakistan Journal of Qur'ānic Studies, 2(2), 158-171.

Rafique, M. O., Qureshi, M. A., Muhaimin, A., & Shah, M. H. (2024). Irrigating Arid Lands: Sustainable Development Through Blue Sukuk. In Climate Change and Finance: Navigating the Challenges and Opportunities in Capital Markets (pp. 323-341). Cham: Springer Nature Switzerland.

Shen, Z., Zhao, M., & Zaib, K. (2024). Cultural aesthetics in language use: Examining expressive elements in novel, short story, and movie communication. Cultura: International Journal of Philosophy of Culture and Axiology, 21(5), 1-21.

Tunio, M. N., Shaikh, E., & Lighari, S. (2021). Multifaceted perils of the Covid-19 and implications: A Review. Studies of Applied Economics, 39(2).

Tunio, M. N., Shaikh, E., Katper, N. K., & Brahmi, M. (2023). Nascent entrepreneurs and challenges in the digital market in developing countries. International Journal of Public Sector Performance Management, 12(1-2), 140-153.